High rabies burden and low vaccination status among dogs inflicting bite in Addis Ababa: an urgent call for action

Sintayehu Abdella1, Khogali Ahmed2, Bienvenu Salim3, Baye Ashenefe1, Yimere Mulugeta1, Endalkachew Girma1, Mesefin Aklilu1, Abebe Getachew1, Guti Kitila1, Garuma Getahun1, Endalkachew Berihanu1, Ibsa File1, Edward Mberu2, Zeyede Zeleke4, Desalegn Getahun1

1 Ethiopian Public Health Institute, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
2 WHO-UNICEF/UNDP/World Bank/WHO Special Program for Research and Training in Tropical Diseases (TDR), Geneva, Switzerland
3 Public Health Department, Maferinyah National Research Center, Ministry of Health, Guinea Lecturer, UGANC, Conakry, Guinea
4 WHO-Country Offices, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Abstract
Introduction: Rabies remains a global threat, killing approximately 60,000 people every year. In Ethiopia, dogs are the main reservoir of the disease. Animals also estimate the burden of the disease.

Methodology: Data from 2016 to 2020 were extracted from a rabies cases recording book of the Ethiopian Public Health Institute. Proportions and trends over time were analyzed. Brain samples of dogs were diagnosed with a Fluorescent Anti Body test.

Results: A total of 6,001 dogs inflicting bites were brought to the laboratory. A high proportion of dogs 4,389 73.14% were not vaccinated. The total number of dogs brought to the laboratory was decreasing over the last five years. Among 1,216 dog brain samples examined 855 (70.3%) confirmed rabies. The proportion of rabies cases was increasing from 8.5% in 2016 and 32.6% in 2020. The highest rabies proportion (33.8%) was reported in 2018. Out of the total (2,156) dogs inflicting bites and observed for 10 days, only 468 (21.7%) of the observation report was tracked and reported.

Conclusions: There is a high proportion of rabies in dogs inflicting bites in Addis Ababa. The findings are alarming with seven out of ten dogs diagnosed being infected with rabies. Only two dogs were vaccinated out of ten dogs inflicting bites. Rabies became a serious public health problem in the city that needs urgent health action from all sectors including the city administration.

Key words: Dog bite; Ethiopia; operational research; rabies; SORT-IT.
integrated dog bite management, vaccine production, mass dog vaccination, providing Post Exposure Prophylaxes (PEP) to exposed humans, and building capacity.

All dogs inflicting bite including laboratory analysis of rabies in and around Addis Ababa is managed thru EPHI. The rabies case management system recommends 10 days quarantine for those suspected brought alive and owned. However, the quarantine report outcome has remained un-captured by the management system and the reporting is dependent on the owner’s discretion to confirm the observation or not.

Thus, recent and reliable data on dog’s vaccination status, the magnitude of rabies had identifying gaps on the surveillance system especially on home quarantine report outcome is deemed, it necessary to support the national rabies control and elimination target as guidance for formulating effective strategy and interventions based on evidence. In addition, the only information is reported by a study that was conducted by Lombamo et al. 2020 6 years ago and status of the disease for the last six years have not been addressed [8].

The aim of this study is, to show the trend of rabies cases, related vaccination status and the gap on quarantine report outcome among dogs inflicting bite reported at the EPHI rabies management services in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia between 2016 and 2020.

Figure 1. Floreacent Antibody Test (FAT) laboratory technique flow chart.

Methodology

Retrospective analysis of routine programme data obtained from EHPI rabies cases record book from 2016 to 2020.

General Setting

Ethiopia is a landlocked country in the horn of Africa with a population of 99.4 million. The country has one of the poorest health coverage (39%) and the current health expenditure per capita is 24 USD [9]. Ethiopia has the third highest number of NTD cases in Africa, 16 of the 20 NTDs in WHO list present [1].

Specific Setting

Addis Ababa is the capital city of Ethiopia and covers an area of 530 km² with an estimated population of around 6.4 Million. The total dog population is estimated to be 370,000 of which 250,000 are owned and 120,000 stray dogs [10].

Laboratory diagnosis and rabies case management services

EPHI is the only national rabies diagnostic and case management center. It supports the national surveillance data system by producing laboratory-based reports. People who have been exposed to bites by dogs present them to EPHI with dead or alive. In the case of dead dogs, a sample of the dog brain is tested for rabies using Floreacent Antibody Test (FAT) (Figure 1).

Assessing vaccination status of dogs inflicting bites and provision of initiation PEP for exposed people, counseling services and home quarantine follow-up are the key activities conducted (Figure 2).

Figure 2. Flow of management services of dogs inflicting bite in EPHI.
Study population and data source

All dogs inflicting bite during 2016 to 2020 and recorded in the rabies cases recording book of EPHI were included in the study.

Data collection and validation

Data from the rabies cases recording book were extracted and double entered in Microsoft Excel sheet and two files were compared and discorances were resolved by cross checking with the original data source.

Data analysis

Data were analyzed using in the Microsoft excel 2013. Percentage and proportions calculated and tables and figures used for presenting the analysis findings.

Ethics considerations

Local ethics approval was sought from the EPHI ethics scientific review board. International ethics approval was sought from the Union Ethics Advisory Group of the Center for Operational Research at the International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, Paris, France. Personal identifiers of the dog-owners were not extracted and only aggregate data were used for analysis. The electronic database was kept on a password protected computer of the principal investigator.

Results

A total number of 6,001 dogs inflicting bites were brought to EPHI rabies diagnostic and exposure management service from 2016 to 2020. Among all dogs, 3,840 (63.9 %) were brought alive, 1,216 (20.2 %) were dead and the rest were not recorded. The total number of dogs brought to EPHI during the study period has been decreasing (Table 1).

Table 1. The observation report outcome among rabies suspected dogs and quarantined for 10 days, during 2016 to 2020, In Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
<th>2019</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status of dogs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,749</td>
<td>1476</td>
<td>923</td>
<td>946</td>
<td>907</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alive</td>
<td>978</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>795</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>670</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dead</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>262</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not record</td>
<td>506</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>419</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Required 10 Days observation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>978</td>
<td>795</td>
<td>670</td>
<td>751</td>
<td>646</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>460</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>277</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>518</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>518</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reported Observation Outcome</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>518</td>
<td>518</td>
<td>390</td>
<td>473</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>415</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>405</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The majority 4,389 (86.7%) of the dogs are not vaccinated. A very limited number of dogs 670/6,001 (11.2%) were found to be vaccinated. However, the vaccination status of dogs increased over the study period. There has been a decrease in the total number of unvaccinated dogs and an increase in vaccinated dogs brought to EPHI. The highest vaccination percentage was 253/981 (25.7%) reported in 2020 and 82/1,474 (5.5 %) was the least vaccination reported in 2016 (Figure 3).

Total numbers of 1,216 dog brain samples were examined for rabies and the proportion of rabies cases in dogs during the last five years was 855 (70.3%). Rabies cases increased exponentially over the study period from 122/1,431 (8.5 %) in 2016 to 181/554 (32.6 %) by the year 2020. During the study period, high rabies cases 206/609 (33.8%) were reported in 2018 (Figure 4).

More than half of the dogs inflicting bites and brought alive to EPHI for rabies examination were recommended to be quarantined at home and observed.
for 10 days 2,156/3,840 (56.1%). However, the observation report outcome was only available for 469/2,156 (21.7%). More than 1, 687/2,156 (78.2%) of the quarantine observation reports were not tracked and reported to EPHI. The overall observation report outcome consistently decreased over the last five years. In 2020 the lowest observation report was registered. Of the total number of dogs brought to EPHI during the study period, the presentation status of 942/6,001 (15.6%) dogs was not recorded (Table 1).

Discussion

This study shows an extended period in the trend of rabies cases and compares the vaccination status of dogs that are inflicting bites in Addis Ababa. The findings are alarming with seven out of ten dogs diagnosed found to be infected by rabies 855/1,216 (70.3%) and only two dogs are vaccinated out of ten dogs brought to EPHI for rabies examination. Rabies in dogs is prevalent in Addis Ababa and the trend has been increasing exponentially over time from 2016 to 2020. The high proportion of rabies cases in dogs is a significant risk for transmission to humans.

These findings are in line with other similar studies conducted in 2010 and 2016 that showed the highest proportion of rabies cases at 77.6% and 61.7% reported in Addis Ababa respectively [8-13]. The persistently high proportion of rabies cases over a long time could indicate the high level of transmission of the disease in Addis Ababa. Some of the reasons for this observation are likely to be related to a large number of stray dogs, a lower level of vaccination coverage, poor management of owned dogs together with low community awareness, and lack of policy or inadequate implementation of guidelines. Reta et al. 2014 observed that one of the reasons for the high rate of unvaccinated dogs includes the limited availability of the vaccine, the high cost of the vaccine, and lack of community awareness [7].

Other study findings by Lombamo et al. 2020 showed that out of a total of 6,100 dogs that inflicted a bite in Addis Ababa from 2012 to 2016, 4,880 (80%) were unvaccinated. In the current study, the unvaccinated status has increased by six percent 4,398/6,001 (86%) in comparison to the previous study [8]. Even though there is the high proportion of unvaccinated dogs, the vaccination showed an increasing and progressive trend from 2016 to 2020. This could be indicative of the activities conducted after the prioritization of rabies as the number one zoonotic flagship disease since 2017; in which integrating and decentralizing counseling services and bite management with sub-cities veterinary clinics and health centers was one of the priority intervention focus.

The study has identified a reporting gap on tracking dogs that are recommended to be observed for 10 days. Out of the total dogs quarantined from 2016 to 2020, only 469/2,156 (21.7%) were reported and the status described. The reason for this reporting gap is that the quarantine system is dependent on the dog owner’s willingness to report or not. This situation contributes to masking the real burden of the disease.

Our findings support the need for a dramatic paradigm shift in the prevention and control of rabies in dogs. An integrated and sustainable rabies control program should be established and consistently employed.

We recommend the following strategies. 1) All stakeholders including the Addis Ababa city administration need to be aware of the magnitude and potential impact of rabies in the city and integrated efforts for control. 2) The community needs to be aware that most of the dogs inflicting bites could be rabid and need to be reported immediately. 3) Mass vaccination of dogs including stray dogs need to be scaled up and conducted periodically 4) The quarantine observation surveillance system needs to be digitized and able to capture the observation report through home visit; which helps to determine the real burden of rabies in Addis Ababa.

Our study had a few limitations. Rabies case recording book was limited some of the records especially on the status of dogs were missing which made triangulation with other variables inadequate.
Acknowledgements
This research was conducted through the Structured Operational Research and Training Initiative (SORT IT) a global partnership coordinated by the Special Programme for Research and Training in (TDR) at the World Health Organization (WHO). The specific SORT IT on NTDs program that led to these publications included a partnership of TDR with the Institute of Tropical Medicine (ITM), Antwerp (Belgium) along with the EPHI, (Ethiopia), the WHO country office in Ethiopia and the International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases, Paris (France).

Funding
This SORT IT NTDs programme was funded by TDR and ITM Antwerp.

References

Corresponding author
Sintayehu Abdella (BSc, MVSc in veterinary microbiology)
P.O. BOX, 1242/5654, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
Phone: +251-913064725
Fax: +251112758634
Email: ruhamasanta10@gmail.com;
sintayehuabdella10@gmail.com

Conflict of interests: No conflict of interests is declared.